What do we know about the relationship between TVET and migration?

Volker Wedekind
Centre for International Education Research
School of Education
• The Migration-TVET-Development Nexus
  • Migrants and Migration
  • Development as a mitigation strategy
  • TVET as a vehicle for development
    • Examples from the research field
  • How do we address the gaps?
Policy research in South Africa and SADC with focus on professions and TVET
Reimagining VET in Africa with specific focus on Uganda and South Africa
Concept paper for UNESCO UNEVOC
Work for GEM Report
UNEVOC Network European Cluster lead on Migration

Combination of desktop literature reviews, interviews and workshops, and case studies
Migration-TVET-Development Nexus

Migration

TVET

Development
‘A picture held us captive. And we could not get outside it, for it lay in our language and language seemed to repeat it to us inexorably.’

Ludwig Wittgenstein,
Philosophical Investigations
More images for migrants
Defining Migration

• Central to all of human development
• Movement of people from a point of origin to a new place
• Modern borders have made it increasingly complex
• Has multiple dimensions
  • From where to where?
  • Does it involve crossing borders?
  • Was it voluntary or forced?
  • What is the reason for the migration?
  • Is it ir/regular/regulated?
  • How do the societies receiving migrants respond?
Typologies

This creates a range of categories of migrants e.g.

• Economic/labour migrants
• Irregular migrants (human trafficking, undocumented migrants)
• Refugees and Asylum Seekers
• Climate migrants
• Internally Displaced Peoples

They are often not clearly distinguishable.
There are always degrees of agency.
Overview of international migration

- 244 million migrants in 2015 out of a global population of 7.3 billion: 1 in every 30 people.
- In 2016, there were 22.9 million refugees (UNHCR, 2017).
- Internally displaced persons by conflicts and disasters are not included in international migration data.
- Between 2008 and 2014, a total of 184.6 million people had been displaced globally by disasters (IDMC & NRC, 2015).
- In 2016, 6.9 million people were displaced by conflict (IDMC & NRC, 2017)
Dimensions of Migration

Source: United Nations, Department of Economic and Social Affairs, Population Division (2017)
(T)VET – (broadly) defined

• ‘education and training which aims to equip people with knowledge, know-how, skills and/or competences required in particular occupations or more broadly in the labour market’ (Cedefop 2014)

• ‘VET is conventionally understood as encompassing the myriad forms of learning that are primarily aimed at supporting participation in the worlds-of-work, whether in terms of (re)integration into work or increased effectiveness of those currently defined as being in work.’ (McGrath 2012)
• Definitional problem – heterogenous
  • Levels
  • Institutions
  • Orientation (learner or employer)
  • Vocationalisation of schooling and higher education colonising the space
• Content/knowledge unclear
  • 21st Century skills, employability skills, transferable skills
  • Core disciplinary content
  • (Liberal Arts?)
  • Applied/Practice
• Unclear what distinguishes it
  • Technical vs technology vs work
  • Professional/Entrepreneurial
  • Status and Stigma
National Variations and Cultural Understandings

- Very divergent social understandings of the value of TVET.
- Policy commitments need to be understood in relation to public views of the relative value of TVET within different contexts.
- In post-colonial contexts this is layered by the different colonial histories.
TVET and Development

• Rise of TVET in most of the world is closely connected to emergence of Human Capital Theory
  • Schultz and others influential in World Bank thinking
  • Significant expenditure on TVET, but then declined… why?
• Lots of evidence that it didn’t work
• However, HCT remains powerful, and thus TVET gains second wind. Why will it work this time around?
• The changes in production in the 4th Industrial Revolution may be signalling the end of work altogether
  • Picture not clear (neo-Luddites? But a Luddite response is legitimate)
  • (Current high levels of employment in US and parts of EU?)
  • Hollowing out
  • Increasing automation, AI etc leaves only services and care (for now)
  • (Disruptive technology on education itself)
• In the 21st century TVET has become decidedly more fashionable
  • Policy makers
  • Development economics
  • Politicians
• All advocating TVET as a panacea for all sorts of social ills
  • MDGs
  • AU (and other regional bodies) TVET Strategy
  • National agendas

And as a means to mitigate the pressures of migration
Africa rising but skills shortage a big worry

T.J. STRYDOM

African business leaders are bullish about the continent’s economic growth prospects. As many as 80% of CEOs in Africa expect their operations to grow this year, compared to 74% of their global counterparts, according to a survey by consultants Frost & Sullivan.

The firm surveyed 310 CEOs and released the findings on Friday. “CEOs in Africa are really bullish about growth, and the key thing is talent management,” said PWV partner for Africa Suresh Kana at a briefing in Sandton.

As Africa’s economic growth outstrips that of all regions other than Southeast Asia, companies are expanding to get a share of the spoils.

Over the next 40 years the continent is expected to build more than 400 cities, said Kana. South Africa’s retailing, notably Shoprite, telecommunications giants MTN and Vodacom, and most of the country’s big banks have ventured north in the last decade to court consumers.

At least 90% of the South African CEOs surveyed expected their revenue from Africa to grow in the next 13 months. The World Bank expects growth to pick up to 4.9% this year from 4.2% last year in sub-Saharan Africa. But the lack of skills is a major obstacle.

For three-quarters of CEOs, the shortage of skills is a threat to growth. The survey showed that nowhere is the shortage of skills more keenly felt than in fast-growing markets such as Africa, where setting up a skilled workforce is regarded as essential by 94% of CEOs.

Kana said there was a shortage of the right people at top and middle management, but there are enough graduates.

“The skills are [there, it is] absorbing them into the economy that is the issue,” he said.

Companies in Africa are looking far and wide, even among expatriates working in developed countries, in their search for capable, qualified new staff.

African CEOs give higher priority to filling talent gaps (31%) than the global average (27%).

The survey revealed that retention of staff was seen as vital in all countries surveyed, with some willing to throw money at it.

“CEOs in Kenya (9%), Tanzania (9%) and Uganda (6%) were almost unanimous in their conviction that matching pay was an essential strategy to avoid losing top talent to the competition."

---

US default ‘would spell catastrophe’

WORLD Bank president Jim Yong Kim has added his voice to those of three of the world’s most powerful bankers, warning of terrible consequences if the US default on its debt.

Kim at the weekend said the US was just “staying away” from causing a global economic disaster unless its politicians came up with a plan to raise the nation’s debt limit and avoid a default.

“Failure could result in interest rates rising, confidence falling and growth slowing,” Kim said.

“If this comes to pass, it could be a disastrous event for the developing world, and that will in turn greatly hurt developing economies.”

Deutsche Bank chief executive Anshu Jain said a default would be “utterly catastrophic”. "This would be a very rapidly spreading fatal disease,” Jain said in Washington at the weekend.

"The US Treasury has said it expects to exhaust the limit of its borrowing authority this week and would not be able to prioritize payments on US debt or those for social security grants. Lawmakers have been at an impasse about raising the debt limit. Republican leaders have been previously closed since funding ran out on October 1, and Republicans insist that a debt ceiling deal includes plans to cut government spending. Last week JPMorgan Chase’s Dimon and other top executives of big US financial services firms met President Barack Obama and lawmakers to urge them to deal with both issues.

On Saturday, Dimon said banks were spending huge amounts preparing for the possibility of a default, which he said would threaten the global recovery after the 2007-2009 financial crisis.

“We need global growth,” he said. “We are on the verge of getting it. Please let’s not shoot ourselves in the foot.”

---

Gordhan wins top award

FINANCIAL Minister Pravin Gordhan has been named Sub-Saharan Africa finance minister of the year.

He was honoured by Emerging Markets, a website specializing in economic and financial news.

“His prudent fiscal policy led by Pravin Gordhan, who became finance minister in 2009 at the height of the global economic crisis, has been praised by analysts, especially since South Africa is more exposed than other emerging markets to dangers stemming from sets of countries. After a quantitatively easing by the Federal Reserve,” the website said. — Staff reporter
• Identified repeatedly in research as a major obstacle
• TVET is most often seen as a ‘last resort’
• Programmes are delivered to accommodate numbers, and don’t connect to the labour market locally or internationally
• Would higher TVET be a more desirable option?
The Entrepreneurial Fantasy

- Often seen as the solution to lack of local labour market opportunities
- Entrepreneurship is hard to teach, and TVET teachers are not good entrepreneurs
- Entrepreneurs that are successful are few in numbers anywhere in the world
  - Unlikely to be a solution for mass unemployment
How can and do VET Systems and ODAs Respond?

- Access and Provision
  - System and Individual
- Recognition of Skills and Qualifications
- Language Support
- VET Curriculum
- Teacher Education
- Mental Health and Well Being
- Guidance
- Support Accessing Work (experience)
Why do young people migrate?

Livelihoods assets
• Human capital
• Social networks
• Finance
• Land
• Technology

Vulnerability context:
• Shocks, seasons, trends

Institutional setting
Amanzi for Food

- Reframing inclusion and intersectionality in agricultural VET in an Eastern Cape VET College
  - Learning Network Formation and Building
  - Training of Trainers (multi-actors in the local Agricultural Learning System)
  - Practical demonstration sites (co-developed)
  - Social media and community radio (expanding local communications)
    (Pesanayi, 2019; Lotz-Sisitka, in press)
- Targets a different demographic
- Changes the dynamics in the community relations
TVET and Refugees and Asylum Seekers

- Dominant focus has been on access to schooling
- NGO driven programmes can be problematic
- Whether in camps or in society, refugees are concentrated in countries with limited resources and often with challenges for the home population
  - Need to avoid preferential treatment of refugees as this exacerbates tensions with local population
  - Need to create opportunities to access and integrate into labour market
- Higher drop-out rates for migrants
  - Need to generate income
  - Frustration at time required
Returnees

• Many migrants desire to return to their home country, but find the reintegration difficult. TVET aimed at returnees is one possible strategy
• However, many of the same challenges face the returnees as face migrants
  • Workplace cultures
  • Varying skill sets
  • Community acceptance
Does aligning systems encourage migration?

• Insufficient evidence at present, but unlikely to be overriding factor
• Bilateral and multilateral agreements allow for better planning and control
• Philippines – Gulf States an interesting example
Conclusions

• The nexus is highly complex and requires solutions that recognize the complexity
• VET organisations cannot address this issue in isolation, but there are aspects that they control that can be improved
  • Strengthening systems NB
• We need to have conversations that shift the focus from purely efficiency related foci to
  • ones that start with the migrant and their diverse needs
  • Look at ourselves and what we can learn
• International collaboration needed
The search for safety is a collective shared agenda

Georg Simmel remarks:
• The stranger learns the art of adaptation more searchingly, if more painfully, than people who feel entitled to belong, at peace with their surrounding.
• The foreigner also holds up a mirror to the society into which he or she enters, since the foreigner cannot take for granted ways of life that seem to natives just natural.

(as paraphrased by Richard Sennett 2008)
Thank you!